



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 23, 2016

Ms. Linda A. Samples
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2016-04304

Dear Ms. Samples:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 599213 (City's Case #15-1026-6914).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified case number. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation and

¹Although the department raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and constitutional privacy generally, the department makes no arguments to support these doctrines. Therefore, we assume the department has withdrawn its claim section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law and constitutional privacy applies to the submitted information. *See Gov't Code* §§ 552.301, .302.

release of the information would interfere with that investigation. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Based on these representations and our review, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is applicable.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may generally withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

However, we note the requestor is an assistant public defender with the Office of the El Paso County Public Defender (the “public defender’s office”). Section 411.1272 of the Government Code provides:

The office of capital writs and a public defender’s office are entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated . . . by the public defender’s office has been appointed.

Gov’t Code § 411.1272. In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides:

(a) Unless otherwise authorized by Subsection (e), a person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

. . .

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Gov’t Code § 411.087(a)(2). “Criminal history record information” (“CHRI”) is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the department’s remaining argument against disclosure, except to note basic information is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2).

Accordingly, the requestor is authorized to obtain the CHRI in the submitted information from the department pursuant to sections 411.087(a)(2) and 411.1272 of the Government Code if it relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender’s office is appointed. *See id.* §§ 411.1272, .087(a)(2)). Although the department raises sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code for such information, a specific statutory right of access prevails over the general exceptions to disclosure found in the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994) (exceptions in the Act generally inapplicable to information that statutes expressly make public), 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge in statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Therefore, if the department determines the submitted information relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender’s office is appointed, then the department must release the information that shows the type of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that instance, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. If the department determines the submitted information does not relate to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender’s office is appointed, then with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Rahat Huq
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RSH/som

Ref: ID# 599213

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)