



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 7, 2016

Mr. Oscar G. Gabaldón, Jr.
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2016-12934

Dear Mr. Gabaldón,:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 613096 (El Paso File Nos. 16-1026-7278 and 16-1026-7295).

The City of El Paso (the "city") received two requests from the same requestor for the 9-1-1 audio recording and computer-assisted dispatch ("CAD") report associated with a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information, which we have indicated, is not responsive to the request for information because it does not consist of the 9-1-1 audio recording or CAD report associated with the specified incident. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request, and the city is not required to release this information in response to this request.

¹Although you also raise section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law and constitutional privacy, you make no arguments to support these doctrines. Therefore, we assume you have withdrawn your claim that these doctrines apply to the submitted information. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and provide documentation demonstrating, the responsive information relates to a pending investigation with the El Paso County District Attorney’s Office. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude the release of the responsive information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is applicable to the responsive information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note, in Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996), this office concluded information contained in a CAD report is substantially the same as basic information. *See* ORD 649 at 3; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 394 at 3 (1983) (there is no qualitative difference between information contained in radio cards or radio logs and front-page offense report information expressly held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*; thus, such information is generally public). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the responsive information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the city’s remaining arguments against disclosure, except to note basic information is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "JB IV", with a horizontal line drawn through the middle of the letters.

Joseph Behnke
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/som

Ref: ID# 613096

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)