



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 1, 2016

Mr. Jason Cozza
City Secretary/Administrator
City of Hallettsville
101 North Main Street
Hallettsville, Texas 77964

OR2016-17172

Dear Mr. Cozza:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 620913.

The City of Hallettsville (the "city") received a request for a specified offense report. You state the city will release some of the submitted information. You claim portions of the remaining information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information pertains to an active and open investigation. Based upon your representation, we conclude the release of the information you marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559

(Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you marked. Therefore, the city may generally withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In this instance, however, we note the requestor is a representative of the Hallettsville Housing Authority (the “housing authority”). The Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) is required to provide criminal history record information (“CHRI”) to a noncriminal justice agency that is authorized to receive CHRI pursuant to a federal statute, executive order or state statute. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(b)(2). In Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997), this office concluded a local housing authority is a noncriminal justice agency authorized by federal statute to receive CHRI. *See* Open Records Decision No. 655 at 4 (1997). The federal Housing Opportunity Program Extension Act of 1996 authorizes housing authorities to obtain criminal records of applicants and tenants. Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) of title 42 of the United States Code provides “the National Crime Information Center, police departments, and other law enforcement agencies shall, upon request, provide information to public housing agencies regarding the criminal conviction records of adult applicants for, or tenants of, public housing for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction.” 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code, an agency that is entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS is also authorized to “obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that [agency].” Gov’t Code § 411.087(a)(2). Thus, a housing authority is authorized to obtain CHRI from a local criminal justice agency such as the city’s police department. *See* ORD 655 at 4; *see also* Gov’t Code §§ 411.083(b)(2), .087(a). CHRI consists of “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2).

Federal law limits the purposes for which a public housing authority may request CHRI. Federal law provides (1) public housing agencies may receive CHRI for adult applicants for public housing or for adult tenants of public housing, and (2) CHRI may only be used for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction. 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) states a housing authority shall be provided access to the CHRI “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law.” *Id.* Based on this language, we conclude section 1437d(q)(1)(A) prevails over section 552.108 of the Government Code. *Cf. Equal Employment Opportunity Comm’n v. City of Orange, Texas*, 905 F. Supp. 381, 382 (E.D. Tex. 1995) (federal law prevails over inconsistent provision of state law). Accordingly, if the information at issue relates to an applicant or tenant of the housing authority, and the city determines the housing authority intends to use the CHRI for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, then, we find the city must release to this requestor the information that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that instance, the city may withhold the remaining information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. However, if the submitted information does not relate to an applicant or tenant of the housing

authority or the city determines the housing authority does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, then, the city may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Further, in considering whether a public citizen’s date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court’s rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees’ dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees’ privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens’ dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Therefore, the city must withhold the dates of birth you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, if the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code does not relate to an applicant or tenant of the housing authority or the city determines the housing authority does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes of application screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, then the city may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1). The city must withhold the dates of birth you have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sidney M. Pounds
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SMP/dm

Ref: ID# 620913

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)