



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 5, 2016

Ms. Susan Estringel  
Legal Assistant  
Texas Department of Public Safety  
P. O. Box 4087  
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2016-17658

Dear Ms. Estringel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 627694 (Progressive claim # 16-3325181; DPS PIR # 16-3743).

The Department of Public Safety (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified accident. You state the department has released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, and the department acknowledges, it did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting this decision. *See id.* § 552.301(b), (e). A governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). This statutory presumption can generally be overcome when information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). Although the

department raises section 552.108 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, in failing to comply with section 552.301, the department has waived its argument under section 552.108, and may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of its own interests under section 552.108. However, the interests of a governmental body, other than the one that failed to comply with section 552.301, to withhold information under section 552.108 can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 2-3 (1991). The department submits documentation showing that the 79<sup>th</sup> District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") objects to the release of the information at issue. Therefore, we will consider whether the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

Next, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(17) information that is also contained in a public court record[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). The submitted information contains court-filed documents that are subject to section 552.022(a)(17) and must be released unless they are made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* Although the department raises section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information, this exception is discretionary in nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); ORDs 665 at 2 n.5, 663 at 5, 177 at 3. Therefore, the department may not withhold the marked court-filed documents under section 552.108. However, because section 552.130 of the Government Code makes information confidential under the Act, we will consider the applicability of this exception for the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why

the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The district attorney's office states the submitted information pertains to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include motor vehicle record information protected by section 552.130 of the Government Code, dates of birth, or the identities of witnesses. *See* ORD 127. Thus, with the exception of the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code and the basic information, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. In releasing the marked court-filed documents, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code and the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office. In releasing the marked court-filed documents, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

---

<sup>1</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the department's remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Jesse Harvey", written over a horizontal line.

Jesse Harvey  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JH/eb

Ref: ID# 627694

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)