



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 16, 2016

Ms. Jennifer Burnett
Office of General Counsel
The University of Texas System
201 West 7th Street, Suite 600
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2016-18520

Dear Ms. Burnett:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 622798 (OGC # 169982).

The University of Texas at Austin (the "university") received a request for a specified survey conducted in a class at the university. You state the university will redact some information pursuant to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is not subject to the Act. We have considered the argument you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we address your argument that, pursuant to section 51.914 of the Education Code, the submitted information is not subject to the Act. Subsection 51.914(a) provides, in relevant part, the information to which it applies is "confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act]." *See* Educ. Code § 51.914(a). Subsection 51.914(b) provides,

¹The United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office (the "DOE") has informed this office FERPA does not permit state and local educational authorities to disclose to this office, without parental consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act. The DOE has determined FERPA determinations must be made by the educational authority in possession of the education records. We have posted a copy of the letter from the DOE to this office on the Attorney General's website: <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/files/og/20060725usdoe.pdf>.

in relevant part, the information to which it applies “is not subject to [the Act].” *See id.* § 51.914(b). However, subsections 51.914(a) and (b) do not remove the information at issue from the Act’s application. We interpret the language of these subsections to mean the types of information protected by section 51.914 are subject to the Act’s application. The Act applies to “public information,” which is defined in section 552.002(a) of the Government Code as information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
 - (A) owns the information;
 - (B) has a right of access to the information; or
 - (C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or
- (3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer’s or employee’s official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov’t Code § 552.002(a). Information is “in connection with the transaction of official business” if it is “created by, transmitted to, received by, or maintained by an officer or employee of the governmental body in the officer’s or employee’s official capacity, or a person or entity performing official business or a government function on behalf of a governmental body, and pertains to official business of the governmental body.” *Id.* § 552.002(a-1). Thus, virtually all of the information in a governmental body’s physical possession constitutes public information and is subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 549 at 4 (1990), 514 at 1-2 (1988). Therefore, we find the submitted information is subject to the Act, and must be released unless it falls within an exception to disclosure under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”² Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 51.914 of the Education Code, which provides, in pertinent part, the following:

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(a) In order to protect the actual or potential value, the following information is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], or otherwise:

(1) all information relating to a product, device, or process, the application or use of such a product, device, or process, and all technological and scientific information (including computer programs) developed in whole or in part at a state institution of higher education, regardless of whether patentable or capable of being registered under copyright or trademark laws, that have a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee; [or]

(2) any information relating to a product, device, or process, the application or use of such product, device, or process, and any technological and scientific information (including computer programs) that is the proprietary information of a person, partnership, corporation, or federal agency that has been disclosed to an institution of higher education solely for the purposes of a written research contract or grant that contains a provision prohibiting the institution of higher education from disclosing such proprietary information to third persons or parties[.]

...

(b) Information maintained by or for an institution of higher education that would reveal the institution's plans or negotiations for commercialization or a proposed research agreement, contract, or grant, or that consists of unpublished research or data that may be commercialized, is not subject to [the Act], unless the information has been published, is patented, or is otherwise subject to an executed license, sponsored research agreement, or research contract or grant. In this subsection, "institution of higher education" has the meaning assigned by Section 61.003 [of the Education Code].

Educ. Code § 51.914(a)(1)-(2), (b). As noted in Open Records Decision No. 651 (1997), the legislature is silent as to how this office or a court is to determine whether particular scientific information has "a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee." ORD 651 at 9-10. Furthermore, whether particular scientific information has such a potential is a question of fact that this office is unable to resolve in the opinion process. *See id.* at 10. Thus, this office has stated in considering whether requested information has "a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee," we will rely on a governmental body's assertion that the information has this potential. *See id.* However, a governmental body's determination that information has a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee is subject to judicial review. *See id.* We note section 51.914 is not applicable to working titles of

experiments or other information that does not reveal the details of the research. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 557 at 3 (1990), 497 at 6-7 (1988).

You state the university is an institution of higher education. *See* Educ. Code § 61.003(8). You also state the submitted information contains the details of research conducted by university faculty. Additionally, you state the submitted information reveals data that is not yet published and may be commercialized. You assert this information is excepted pursuant to section 51.914(b). Based on your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of section 51.914(b) of the Education Code to the submitted information. Accordingly, the university must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.914 of the Education Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sidney M. Pounds
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SMP/akg

Ref: ID# 622798

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)