



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 25, 2016

Mr. James Kopp
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
PO Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2016-19207

Dear Mr. Kopp:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 627671 (COSA File No. W126227).

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received a request for specified police reports. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information relates to open criminal investigations. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code is applicable to the submitted information.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the city may generally withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the city must generally withhold the information we marked in report 2016-0484260 from the basic information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the city has failed to demonstrate the remaining basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the city may not withhold the remaining basic information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In this instance, however, we note the requestor is a representative of the San Antonio Public Housing Authority (the "housing authority"). The Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") is required to provide criminal history record information ("CHRI") to a noncriminal justice agency that is authorized to receive CHRI pursuant to a federal statute, executive order or state statute. See *id.* § 411.083(b)(2). In Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997), this office concluded a local housing authority is a noncriminal justice agency authorized by federal statute to receive CHRI. See ORD 655 at 4. The federal Housing Opportunity Program Extension Act of 1996 authorizes housing authorities to obtain criminal records of applicants and tenants. Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) of title 42 of the United States Code provides "the National Crime Information Center, police departments, and other law enforcement agencies shall, upon request, provide information to public housing agencies regarding the criminal conviction records of adult applicants for, or tenants of, public housing for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction." 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code, an agency that is entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS is also authorized to "obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [[CHRI] maintained by that [agency]." Gov't Code

§ 411.087(a)(2). Thus, a housing authority is also authorized to obtain CHRI from a local criminal justice agency such as the city's police department. *See* ORD 655 at 4; *see also* Gov't Code §§ 411.083(b)(2), .087(a). CHRI consists of "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2).

Federal law limits the purposes for which a public housing authority may request CHRI. Federal law provides that (1) public housing agencies may receive CHRI for adult applicants for public housing or for adult tenants of public housing, and (2) CHRI may only be used for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction. 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) states a housing authority shall be provided access to the CHRI "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law." *Id.* Based on this language, we conclude section 1437d(q)(1)(A) prevails over section 552.108 of the Government Code. *Cf. Equal Employment Opportunity Comm'n v. City of Orange, Texas*, 905 F. Supp. 381, 382 (E.D. Tex. 1995) (federal law prevails over inconsistent provision of state law). We also note a statutory right of access generally prevails over the common law. *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Accordingly, if the information at issue relates to an applicant or tenant of the housing authority, and the city determines the housing authority intends to use the CHRI for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, then, we find the city must release to this requestor the information that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). In that instance, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the remaining information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. However, if the submitted information does not relate to an applicant or tenant of the housing authority or the city determines the housing authority does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, then, the city may, with the exception of basic information, withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Ashley Crutchfield". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, prominent initial "A".

Ashley Crutchfield
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AC/dls

Ref: ID# 627671

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)