



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 26, 2016

Mr. John Saenz  
Crime Records Office  
City of McAllen Police Department  
P.O. Box 220  
McAllen, Texas 78505-0220

OR2016-21711

Dear Mr. Saenz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 628174.

The McAllen Police Department (the "department") received a request for records pertaining to two named individuals. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering

---

<sup>1</sup>Although you raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 552.108 of the Government Code, we note section 552.101 does not encompass other exceptions in the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 1-2 (2002), 575 at 2 (1990).

prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person does not implicate the privacy interest of the individual and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

You assert the present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual who is not the requestor's client. Thus, we find the request generally implicates this individual's right to privacy. However, we note the requestor also asks for information held by the department involving the requestor's client. This part of the request seeks specified records involving the requestor's client. Therefore, information involving the requestor's client may not be withheld as a compilation of criminal history under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Accordingly, with the exception of the report involving the requestor's client, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the other named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note you have submitted a report that does not depict the other named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Thus, this information is not part of a criminal history compilation protected by common-law privacy and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. Therefore, we will address your arguments against the disclosure of the information at issue.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the Exhibit B pertains to an open criminal investigation that is inactive pending additional information. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of Exhibit B would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to Exhibit B.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must

demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); Open Records Decision No. 434 (1986). You state Exhibit D pertains to a concluded criminal investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on this representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to in Exhibit D.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing the types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the report involving the requestor’s client, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Matthew Taylor  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MHT/dls

Ref: ID# 628174

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)