



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 7, 2016

Mr. Ricardo Vela, Jr.  
Assistant District Attorney  
Dallas County District Attorney's Office  
Frank Crowley Courts Building  
133 North Riverfront Boulevard, LB19  
Dallas, Texas 75207-4399

OR2016-22540

Dear Mr. Vela:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 630533.

The Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes a court-filed document. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record[,]" unless the information is expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). The district attorney's office seeks to withhold the information at issue under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code. However, these sections are discretionary exceptions to disclosure that protect a governmental body's interests and do not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally); *Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov't Code § 552.103); 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold the court-filed document, which we have marked, under sections 552.103 and 552.108. You claim

section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy for a portion of the court-filed document. We note common-law privacy is not applicable to information contained in public records. *See Star-Telegram, Inc. v. Walker*, 834 S.W.2d 54, 57 (Tex. 1992) (law cannot recall information once in public domain). Therefore, no portion of the court-filed document may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we will consider the district attorney's office's other arguments under section 552.101 because section 552.101 makes information confidential. We will also consider all of your arguments for the information not subject to section 552.022.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information pertains to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution. We note, however, the information at issue includes a DIC-24S statutory warning and a DIC-25S notice of suspension. Copies of these forms were provided to the arrestee. You have not explained how releasing this information, which has been provided to the arrestee, would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Accordingly, the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms may not be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1). However, based on your representation, we conclude release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

Additionally, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms and basic information, the district attorney's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Next, we address your argument under section 552.103 of the Government Code for basic information and the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms. Section 552.103 provides:

- (a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

The district attorney's office states the information relates to a prosecution that was pending when the request was received. We note the purpose of section 552.103 is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties to obtain information related to litigation through the discovery process. *See* ORD 551 at 4-5. Thus, any information obtained from or provided to all other parties in the anticipated or pending litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a) and must be disclosed. As noted above, the submitted DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms were provided to the arrestee; thus, the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms were inevitably seen by the opposing party to the litigation. Furthermore, basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991). Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold the DIC-24 and DIC-25 forms or basic information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

Next, we will consider your remaining arguments for the remaining information. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See* Gov't Code § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are

entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. Upon review, we find a portion of the remaining information, which we have marked, consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. No portion of the remaining information consists of CHRI under section 411.083 and therefore, may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, including chapter 552, Government Code, except as provided by sections 730.005-730.007, an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record.” Transp. Code § 730.004. Section 730.004 applies only to an “agency” that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records. *See id.* § 730.003(1). You have not established the district attorney's office compiles or maintains motor vehicle records for purposes of chapter 730; therefore, section 730.004 does not apply to the district attorney's office, and the district attorney's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.<sup>1</sup> *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3. Thus, the district attorney's office must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked in the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.102(a) exempts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the “Act”). Gov’t Code § 552.147. No portion of the remaining information contains a social security number. Thus, the district attorney’s office may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the court-filed document, the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms, and basic information, the district attorney’s office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The district attorney’s office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083. The district attorney’s office must withhold the public citizen’s date of birth we have marked in the DIC-24S and DIC-25S forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Kunst  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

EK/eb

Ref: ID# 630533

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

