



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 13, 2016

Ms. Sara Copeland
City Secretary
City of Andrews
111 Logsdon
Andrews, Texas 79714-6589

OR2016-23037

Dear Ms. Copeland:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 636229.

The City of Andrews (the "city") received a request for all information pertaining to the requestor's child. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 of the Family Code provides, in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j). For purposes of section 58.007(c), a "child" is a person ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information involves juveniles engaged in delinquent conduct on or after September 1, 1997. Thus, the submitted information is subject to section 58.007(c). In this instance, however, the requestor is the parent of one of the juvenile offenders at issue. Thus, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning her child pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e). However, pursuant to section 58.007(j)(1), any personally identifiable information concerning other juvenile suspects, offenders, victims, or witnesses must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(1). Thus, the city must withhold the identifying information of the other juvenile offender, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code. Additionally, section 58.007(j)(2) provides information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address whether the information at issue is otherwise excepted under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.¹ *Texas Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. We note the requestor has a right of access to the private information of his minor child under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at (4) (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information includes the date of birth of the other juvenile offender. We note the privacy interest of this individual who has been de-identified pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code is protected. Therefore, the city may not withhold the date of birth of the de-identified individual under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential.² *See* Gov't Code § 552.1175. We note section 552.1175 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a

¹Section 552.102(a) exempts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code if the individual whose information is at issue is a licensed peace officer, he elects to restrict access to this information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code, and the cellular telephone service was not paid for by a governmental body.

In summary, the city must withhold the identifying information of other juvenile offender we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(j)(1) of the Family Code. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code if the individual whose information is at issue is a licensed peace officer, he elects to restrict access to this information in accordance with section 552.1175(b) of the Government Code, and the cellular telephone service was not paid for by a governmental body. The city must release the remaining information to this requestor.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,


Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/bhf

³We note the requestor has a special right of access to information being released pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 58.007(e). If the city receives another request for this information from a different requestor, then the city should again seek a ruling from this office. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).

Ref: ID# 636229

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)