



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 10, 2016

Mr. Guillermo Trevino
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, Third Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2016-25119

Dear Mr. Trevino:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 633823 (City of Fort Worth PIR No. W054580).

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified accident involving the requestor's client. You state you have released some of the requested information, including the police officer's crash report pursuant to section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(c) (providing for release of accident report to person or entity listed under this subsection). We understand you will redact motor vehicle record information under section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

....
(17) information that is also contained in a public court record[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). The submitted information contains a court-filed document subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. The department must release this information pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17), unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold this information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, this section is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Open Records Decision No. 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver); see also Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions).* Therefore, the information at issue may not be withheld under section 552.108. However, you also raise section 552.101 of the Government Code for the information at issue, which protects information made confidential under law. Accordingly, we will address the applicability of this section to the information at issue. Additionally, we will address your assertion of section 552.108 for the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(17).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, including section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

....
(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile

Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation by the department of alleged or suspected child abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Therefore, we find the submitted information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. We note the requestor is the authorized representative of the child victim listed in the report. Thus, the requestor has a right of access to the responsive information pursuant to section 261.201(k), and the department may not withhold it from him on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Accordingly, we will address your remaining argument against disclosure of the information at issue.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). We note the information at issue includes a DIC-24 statutory warning and a DIC-25 notice of suspension. Because the department provided copies of these forms to the arrestee, we find their release will not interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. Therefore, the department may not withhold the DIC-24 statutory warning or DIC-25 notice of suspension, which we have marked for release, under section 552.108(a)(1). You state the remaining information at issue relates to an open and pending criminal investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559, 560-61 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108(a)(1) does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the DIC-24 statutory warning, and the DIC-25 notice of suspension, which must be released, the department may withhold the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. In considering whether a public citizen's date of birth is private, the Third Court of Appeals looked to the supreme court's rationale in *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts v. Attorney General of Texas*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The supreme court concluded public employees' dates of birth are private under section 552.102 of the Government Code because the employees' privacy interest substantially outweighed the negligible public interest in disclosure.² *Tex. Comptroller*, 354 S.W.3d at 347-48. Based on *Texas Comptroller*, the court of appeals concluded the privacy rights of public employees apply equally to public citizens, and thus, public citizens' dates of birth are also protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *City of Dallas*, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3. Thus, within the submitted DIC-24 statutory warning and the DIC-25 notice of suspension, the department must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the DIC-24 statutory warning, and the DIC-25 notice of suspension, which must be released, the department may withhold the information not subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the DIC-24 statutory warning and the DIC-25 notice of suspension, the department must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Additionally, the department must release the information we have marked for release under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code.³

²Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a).

³We note the requestor has a right of access to the information being released pursuant to section 261.201(k) of the Family Code. See Fam. Code § 261.201(k). Thus, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Cole Hutchison". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Cole Hutchison
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CH/bhf

Ref: ID# 633823

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)